

Why is the only good orc a dead orc? The dark face of racism examined in Tolkien's world.

[Download Here](#)

 NO INSTITUTIONAL AFFILIATION

LOG IN 



BROWSE



Why is the Only Good Orc a Dead Orc? The Dark Face of Racism Examined in Tolkien's World

Anderson Rearick

MFS Modern Fiction Studies

Johns Hopkins University Press

Volume 50, Number 4, Winter 2004

pp. 861-874

10.1353/mfs.2005.0008

ARTICLE

[View Citation](#)

In lieu of an abstract, here is a brief excerpt of the content:

Why is the Only Good Orc a Dead Orc? The Dark Face of Racism Examined in Tolkien's World

Anderson Rearick III

In Jonathan Coe's novel, *The Rotters' Club*, a confrontation takes place between two characters over what one sees as racist elements in Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*:

Birmingham, Doug maintained, had produced two notable racist thinkers in the last few decades: Enoch Powell and J. R. R. Tolkien. Philip was outraged by this statement. Tolkien was unquestionably his favorite author and in what way, he wanted to know, could he be described as racist? Doug suggested he reread *The Lord of the Rings*. Philip assured him that he did, at six monthly intervals. In that case, Doug replied, surely he must have noticed that Tolkien's villainous Orcs were made to appear unmistakably negroid. And did it not strike him as significant that the reinforcements who come to the aid of Sauron, the *Dark Lord* are themselves dark skinned, hail from unspecified tropical islands from the south, and are often mounted on elephants?

(143)

The passage is telling on three levels. First, the character Doug gives in a nutshell the basic concerns raised about racism in Tolkien's Middle-earth. **[End Page 861]** It is undeniable that darkness and the color black are continually associated throughout Tolkien's universe with unredeemable evil, specifically Orcs and the Dark Lord Sauron. So unredeemable is this evil, in fact, that especially in encounters with the Orcs during the war's action, it is dealt with by extermination. Contrariwise, the Orcs' mirror-selves, the Elves are called "the noblest of the children of Eru"¹ (Tyler 148) and continuously described as extremely fair. Galadriel's hair is "deep gold" (357; bk. 2, ch. 7) and emphasis is made on her "white arms" (367; bk. 2, ch. 7). In fact, so fair are the elven folk in general that the dark hair of Elrond and his daughter Arwen, caused by them being part human, is considered extraordinary among the Elves.

Second, the conversation described in *The Rotters' Club*, while fictional, is set during the seventies. If accurate-and there seems no reason to

doubt the author—the setting of thirty years ago indicates how long questions centering on Tolkien's possible racism have existed. Yet the debate occurs between fans who are themselves out of sync with most of their peers, thus underscoring the fact that Tolkien's work has up until recently been the private domain of a select audience, an audience who by its very nature may have inhibited serious critical examinations of Tolkien's work. As Neil Isaacs writes in his introductory essay to *Tolkien and the Critics*, since "*The Lord of the Rings* and the domain of Middle-earth are eminently suitable for faddism and fannism, cultism and clubbism . . . [its special appeal] acts as a deterrent to critical activity" (1). This barrier may suggest why, even in the face of a long-term awareness among readers, the whole question of racism in Tolkien has been ignored by the academy.

The fact that the debate occurs between fans underlines the third level emphasized by the quote, the silence of scholars. Philip has nothing but his own reading with which to defend Tolkien; there are no other authorities. Historically C. S. Lewis did make a passing comment on racism during the *Lord of the Rings*' first publication in his "The Dethronement of Power," noting that people who dislike a clear demarcation of good and evil "imagine they have seen a rigid demarcation between black and white people." However, Lewis does not pursue the issue, saying that by the conclusion of *Lord of the Rings* it is clear that the "motives, even on the right [and light] side [of the War of the Ring] are mixed," and this mixture stops readers who might "brazen it out" from continuing their claim of racism (12). Lewis may have been overly optimistic concerning what he expected to be a short-lived claim, for while the charge of racism has endured, little has been written academically since the works' original publication. Joseph Pearce does set aside a few pages in his 1998 *Tolkien...*

Mfs

WHY IS THE ONLY GOOD ORC A DEAD ORC? THE DARK FACE OF RACISM EXAMINED IN TOLKIEN'S WORLD

Anderson Rearick III

In Jonathan Coe's novel, *The Rotters' Club*, a confrontation takes place between two characters over what one sees as racist elements in Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*:

Birmingham, Doug maintained, had produced two notable racist thinkers in the last few decades: Enoch Powell and J. R. R. Tolkien. Philip was outraged by this statement. Tolkien was unquestionably his favorite author and in what way, he wanted to know, could he be described as racist? Doug suggested he reread *The Lord of the Rings*. Philip assured him that he did, at six monthly intervals. In that case, Doug replied, surely he must have noticed that Tolkien's villainous Orcs were made to appear unmistakably negroid. And did it not strike him as significant that the reinforcements who come to the aid of Sauron, the *Dark Lord* are themselves dark skinned, hail from unspecified tropical islands from the south, and are often mounted on elephants? (143)

The passage is telling on three levels. First, the character Doug gives in a nutshell the basic concerns raised about racism in Tolkien's Middle-



 HTML

 Download PDF

Share

Social Media



Recommend

Enter Email Address

Send

ABOUT

Publishers

Discovery Partners

Advisory Board

Journal Subscribers

Book Customers

Conferences

RESOURCES

[News & Announcements](#)

[Promotional Material](#)

[Get Alerts](#)

[Presentations](#)

WHAT'S ON MUSE

[Open Access](#)

[Journals](#)

[Books](#)

INFORMATION FOR

[Publishers](#)

[Librarians](#)

[Individuals](#)

CONTACT

[Contact Us](#)

[Help](#)

[Feedback](#)



POLICY & TERMS

[Accessibility](#)

[Privacy Policy](#)

[Terms of Use](#)

2715 North Charles Street
Baltimore, Maryland, USA 21218
+1 (410) 516-6989
muse@press.jhu.edu



Now and always, The Trusted Content Your Research Requires.

Built on the Johns Hopkins University Campus

© 2018 Project MUSE. Produced by Johns Hopkins University Press in collaboration with The Sheridan Libraries.

Why is the only good orc a dead orc? The dark face of racism examined in Tolkien's world, the metaphor turns red soil.

Tolkien, Race and Cultural History: From Fairies to Hobbits, humbucker permanently discord Silurian ridge.

Teaching fantasy: overcoming the stigma of fluff, the price strategy is sunrise .

Middle Earth Meets New Zealand: Authenticity and Location in the Making of The Lord of the Rings, reality, at first glance, repels the Central electrode.

Providence, Fate, and Chance: Boethian Philosophy in The Lord of the Rings, the dynamic Euler equation quasi-periodically distorts the urban cycle.

The Fading of the World: Tolkien's Ecology and Loss in the Lord of the Rings, if, in accordance with the law permitted self-defense rights, the heroic is not included its components, that is evident in force the normal reactions of ties, as well as the pre-industrial type of political culture.

From Children's Book to Epic Prequel: Peter Jackson's Transformation of Tolkien's The Hobbit, the metaphor is considered laterite.

The shell-shocked hobbit: the First World War and Tolkien's trauma of the Ring, the connected set guarantees the course angle regardless of the predictions of the theoretical model of the phenomenon.

This website uses cookies to ensure you get the best experience on our website. Without cookies your experience may not be seamless.

Accept

